

STATE OF MICHIGAN
IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF ANTRIM

WILLIAM BAILEY

Plaintiff

Case No. 20-9238-CZ

v.

ANTRIM COUNTY

HON. KEVIN A. ELSENHEIMER

Defendant,

SECRETARY OF STATE JOCELYN
BENSON

Intervenor-Defendant,

Matthew S. DePerno (P52622)
DEPERNO LAW OFFICE, PLLC
Attorney for Plaintiff
951 W. Milham Avenue
PO Box 1595
Portage, MI 49081
(269) 321-5064

Haider A. Kazim (P66146)
CUMMINGS, MCCLOREY, DAVIS & ACHO, PLC
Attorney for Defendant
319 West Front Street
Suite 221
Traverse City, MI 49684
(231) 922-1888

Heather S. Meingast (P55439)
Erik A. Grill (P64713)
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorneys for Proposed Intervenor-Defendant
Benson
PO Box 30736
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7659

AFFIDAVIT OF BENJAMIN R. COTTON 8 APRIL 2021

I, Ben Cotton, being duly sworn, hereby depose and state as follows:

1) I am over the age of 18, and I understand and believe in the obligations of an oath.

I make this affidavit of my own free will and based on first-hand information and my own personal observations.

2) I am the founder of CyFIR, LLC (CyFIR).

3) I have a master's degree in Information Technology Management from the University of Maryland University College. I have numerous technical certifications, including the Certified Information Systems Security Professional (CISSP), Microsoft Certified Professional (MCP), Network+, and Certified CyFIR Forensics and Incident Response Examiner.

4) I have over twenty five (25) years of experience performing computer forensics and other digital systems analysis.

5) I have over eighteen (18) years of experience as an instructor of computer forensics and incident response. This experience includes thirteen (13) years of experience teaching students on the Guidance Software (now OpenText) EnCase Investigator and EnCase Enterprise software.

6) I have testified as an expert witness in state and federal courts and before the United States Congress.

7) I regularly lead engagements involving digital forensics for law firms, corporations, and government agencies.

8) In connection with this legal action I have had the opportunity to examine the following devices:

a) Antrim County Election Management Server Image. This image was acquired on 4 December 2020 by a firm named Sullivan and Strickler.

b) Thirty eight (38) forensic images of the compact flash cards used in Antrim County during the November 2020 elections that were imaged on 4 December 2020 by a firm named Sullivan and Strickler.

c) One (1) SID-15v-Z37-A1R, commonly known as the Image Cast X (ICX), that was used in the November 2020 elections

d) Two (2) Thumbdrives that were configured for a precinct using the ES&S DS400 tabulator that were used during the November 2020 election.

e) One ES&S server that was used in the November 2020 election.

9) **Internet Communications with the Dominion ICX.** I examined the forensic image of a Dominion ICX system utilized in the November 2020 election and discovered evidence of internet communications to a number of public and private IP addresses. Of specific concern was the presence of the IP address 120.125.201.101 in the unallocated space of the 10th partition of the device. This IP address resolves back to the Ministry of Education Computer Center, 12F, No 106, Sec.2,Hoping E. Rd.,Taipei Taiwan 106. This IP address is contextually in close proximity to data that would indicate that it was part of the socket configuration and stream of an TCP/IP communication session. Located at physical sector 958273, cluster 106264, sector offset 256, file offset 54407424 of the storage drive, the unallocated nature of the artifact precludes the exact definition of the date and time that this data was created. Also located in close proximity to the Ministry of Education IP address is the IP address 62.146.7.79. This IP address resolves to a cloud provider in Germany.

Figure 1-IP Addresses Located in Unallocated Space

Further examination of the ICX clearly indicates that this system is also actively configured to communicate on a private network of 10.114.192.x with FTP settings to connect to 10.114.192.12 and 10.114.192.25. Also apparent is that at one time this system was configured to have the IP address 192.168.1.50. This IP address is also a private IP range. These IP configurations and artifacts definitively identify two things, 1) the device has been actively used for network communications and 2) that this device has communicated to public IP addresses not located in the United States. Further analysis and additional devices would be required to determine the timeframe of these public IP communications.

10) **ESS DS400 Communications.** A careful examination of the ESS DS400 devices and thumb drives was conducted. This examination proved that each DS400 had a Verizon cellular wireless communications card installed and that the card was active on powerup, which meant that there is the ability to connect to the public internet on these devices as well. Both of the DS400 devices were configured to transmit election results to IP address 10.48.51.1. This is a private network, which means that it would only be accessible by the remote DS400 systems through leveraging the public internet and establishing a link to a communications gateway using a public IP or via a virtual private network (VPN). It is important to understand that this

communication can only occur if the cellular modems have access to the public internet. I did not have the entire communications infrastructure for the private network and given this lack of device production associated with the DS200, I can not say which other devices may have connected to this private network nor the full extent of the communications of nor the remote accesses to the DS400 devices.

11) **Out of Date Security Updates and Virus Definitions.** An analysis of operating system, and antivirus settings on the servers and computers provided to me was conducted. It was immediately apparent that these systems were extremely vulnerable to unauthorized remote access and manipulation. For example, none of the operating systems had been patched nor the antivirus definition files updated for years. The Antrim EMS was last updated in 2016. The other systems were in a similar state. This lack of security updating has left these systems in an extremely vulnerable state to remote manipulation and hacking. Since 2016 more than ninety seven (97) critical updates have been issued for the Windows 10 operating system to prevent unauthorized access and hacking. The fact that these systems are in such a state of vulnerability, coupled with the obvious public and private internet access, calls the integrity of the voting systems into question. The Halderman report dated March 26, 2021 relating to this matter validates this finding. It also validates that the system is in a state such that an unauthorized user can easily bypass the passwords for the system and database to achieve unfettered access to the voting system in a matter of minutes. These manipulations and password bypass methodologies can be performed remotely if the unauthorized user gains access to the system through the private network or the public internet.

12) **Incomplete Compliance with the Subpoena for Digital Discovery.** Antrim County has apparently failed to produce all of the voting equipment for digital preservation and analysis. I

examined the purchase documents produced by Antrim County with respect to the purchase of the Dominion Voting system and note that the following system components listed on the purchase documents were not produced:

- (a) ImageCast Listener Express Server
- (b) ImageCast Express Firewall
- (c) EMS Express Managed Switch
- (d) ICP Wireless Modems (17)
- (e) Image Cast Communications Manager Server
- (f) ImageCast Listener Express RAS (remote access server) System
- (g) ImageCast USB Modems (5)

Without these system components it will be impossible to determine the extent of public and private communications, the extent to which remote access to the voting system components is possible and to determine if or when unauthorized access occurred.

SIGNED UNDER THE PAINS AND PENALTIES OF PERJURY THIS 8th DAY OF April 2021.



Benjamin R. Cotton