

STATE OF MICHIGAN

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF ANTRIM

WILLIAM BAILEY

Plaintiff

Case No. 20-9238-CZ

v.

ANTRIM COUNTY

HON. KEVIN A. ELSSENHEIMER

Defendant,

SECRETARY OF STATE JOCELYN  
BENSON

Intervenor-Defendant,

---

Matthew S. DePerno (P52622)  
DEPERNO LAW OFFICE, PLLC  
Attorney for Plaintiff  
951 W. Milham Avenue  
PO Box 1595  
Portage, MI 49081  
(269) 321-5064

---

Haider A. Kazim (P66146)  
CUMMINGS, MCCLOREY, DAVIS & ACHO, PLC  
Attorney for Defendant  
319 West Front Street  
Suite 221  
Traverse City, MI 49684  
(231) 922-1888

Heather S. Meingast (P55439)  
Erik A. Grill (P64713)  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Attorneys for Proposed Intervenor-Defendant  
Benson  
PO Box 30736  
Lansing, MI 48909  
(517) 335-7659

---

**AFFIDAVIT OF BENJAMIN R. COTTON 8 APRIL 2021**

I, Ben Cotton, being duly sworn, hereby depose and state as follows:

1) I am over the age of 18, and I understand and believe in the obligations of an oath. I make this affidavit of my own free will and based on first-hand information and my own personal observations.

2) I am the founder of CyFIR, LLC (CyFIR).

3) I have a master's degree in Information Technology Management from the University of Maryland University College. I have numerous technical certifications, including the Certified Information Systems Security Professional (CISSP), Microsoft Certified Professional (MCP), Network+, and Certified CyFIR Forensics and Incident Response Examiner.

4) I have over twenty five (25) years of experience performing computer forensics and other digital systems analysis.

5) I have over eighteen (18) years of experience as an instructor of computer forensics and incident response. This experience includes thirteen (13) years of experience teaching students on the Guidance Software (now OpenText) EnCase Investigator and EnCase Enterprise software.

6) I have testified as an expert witness in state and federal courts and before the United States Congress.

7) I regularly lead engagements involving digital forensics for law firms, corporations, and government agencies.

8) In connection with this legal action I have had the opportunity to examine the following devices:

a) Antrim County Election Management Server Image. This image was acquired on 4 December 2020 by a firm named Sullivan and Strickler.

- b) Thirty eight (38) forensic images of the compact flash cards used in Antrim County during the November 2020 elections that were imaged on 4 December 2020 by a firm named Sullivan and Strickler.
  - c) One (1) SID-15v-Z37-A1R, commonly known as the Image Cast X (ICX), that was used in the November 2020 elections
  - d) Two (2) Thumbdrives that were configured for a precinct using the ES&S DS400 tabulator that were used during the November 2020 election.
  - e) One ES&S server that was used in the November 2020 election.
- 9) **Internet Communications with the Dominion ICX.** I examined the forensic image of a Dominion ICX system utilized in the November 2020 election and discovered evidence of internet communications to a number of public and private IP addresses. Of specific concern was the presence of the IP address 120.125.201.101 in the unallocated space of the 10<sup>th</sup> partition of the device. This IP address resolves back to the Ministry of Education Computer Center, 12F, No 106, Sec.2,Hoping E. Rd.,Taipei Taiwan 106. This IP address is contextually in close proximity to data that would indicate that it was part of the socket configuration and stream of an TCP/IP communication session. Located at physical sector 958273, cluster 106264, sector offset 256, file offset 54407424 of the storage drive, the unallocated nature of the artifact precludes the exact definition of the date and time that this data was created. Also located in close proximity to the Ministry of Education IP address is the IP address 62.146.7.79. This IP address resolves to a cloud provider in Germany.



communication can only occur if the cellular modems have access to the public internet. I did not have the entire communications infrastructure for the private network and given this lack of device production associated with the DS200, I can not say which other devices may have connected to this private network nor the full extent of the communications of nor the remote accesses to the DS400 devices.

11) **Out of Date Security Updates and Virus Definitions.** An analysis of operating system, and antivirus settings on the servers and computers provided to me was conducted. It was immediately apparent that these systems were extremely vulnerable to unauthorized remote access and manipulation. For example, none of the operating systems had been patched nor the antivirus definition files updated for years. The Antrim EMS was last updated in 2016. The other systems were in a similar state. This lack of security updating has left these systems in an extremely vulnerable state to remote manipulation and hacking. Since 2016 more than ninety seven (97) critical updates have been issued for the Windows 10 operating system to prevent unauthorized access and hacking. The fact that these systems are in such a state of vulnerability, coupled with the obvious public and private internet access, calls the integrity of the voting systems into question. The Halderman report dated March 26, 2021 relating to this matter validates this finding. It also validates that the system is in a state such that an unauthorized user can easily bypass the passwords for the system and database to achieve unfettered access to the voting system in a matter of minutes. These manipulations and password bypass methodologies can be performed remotely if the unauthorized user gains access to the system through the private network or the public internet.


12) **Incomplete Compliance with the Subpoena for Digital Discovery.** Antrim County has apparently failed to produce all of the voting equipment for digital preservation and analysis. I

examined the purchase documents produced by Antrim County with respect to the purchase of the Dominion Voting system and note that the following system components listed on the purchase documents were not produced:

- (a) ImageCast Listener Express Server
- (b) ImageCast Express Firewall
- (c) EMS Express Managed Switch
- (d) ICP Wireless Modems (17)
- (e) Image Cast Communications Manager Server
- (f) ImageCast Listener Express RAS (remote access server) System
- (g) ImageCast USB Modems (5)

Without these system components it will be impossible to determine the extent of public and private communications, the extent to which remote access to the voting system components is possible and to determine if or when unauthorized access occurred.

SIGNED UNDER THE PAINS AND PENALTIES OF PERJURY THIS 8th DAY OF April 2021.

  
Benjamin R. Cotton